Concepts of sustainable infrastructure and their implementation

Sven-Uwe Mueller
Senior Advisor
Seconded to the Inter-American Development Bank

Washington Area Branch (WAB) of IAIA
Workshop on
Large Infrastructure Projects:
Integrating Sustainability and Managing Risks
February 15, 2017 (3:00-5:00 pm)
MIGA, World Bank U Building, 1800 G Street, NW
What is sustainable infrastructure?

The landscape of concepts

How we can achieve more sustainability in infrastructure projects?

The interaction of safeguards and SI assessment methods
UN ESCAP: “Sustainable Infrastructure in Asia” in 2006

- Use resources efficiently to obtain greater value from fewer resources and to reduce waste and impacts.
- Minimize externalities when considering market failures, including life cycle costs and the social benefits of policy tools.
- Use both mandatory and voluntary systems for assessing and reducing environmental impacts, including raising awareness of policy makers and the public.
- Promote the use of eco-efficient indicators to measure environmental sustainability for infrastructure development.
- Promote appropriate technology for eco-efficient infrastructure focusing on local and renewal energy, climate responsive design for building, and waste management and treatment.
- Promote effective multi-stakeholder partnership involving key actors.
- Use innovative financing and procurement methods such as cost sharing and partnering.
- Promote demand-side management or a service-focused approach keeping in mind the end users’ needs.

Source: Sustainable Infrastructure in Asia, Overview and Proceedings, Seoul Initiative Policy Forum on Sustainable Infrastructure, Seoul, Republic of Korea, 6-8 September 2006

• Address the following sectors: transport, energy, water, and Information and Communication Technologies (ICT) for development;
• Focused approach to complex cross-sectoral issues such as the role of infrastructure in climate change mitigation and adaptation efforts, the role of public private partnerships (PPPs) in the provision of infrastructure services, and new ways to provide infrastructure support for rural-urban integration and development;
• Focus on social and environmental objectives in addition to the economic/financial viability and ensure access to affordable infrastructure services through a platform of strong governance;
• Leverage WBG financing through:
  (a) support to governments to create a market environment supportive of private investment;
  (b) direct support for private financing of infrastructure;
  (c) advocacy to ramp up harmonized donor financing
  (d) use of financial products that address the financial risks faced by clients and reduce the overall project costs.

Sustainable Infrastructure in EBRD

- There is no single definition
- EBRD views the issue holistically, encompassing investments and institutional strengthening to foster:
  - improved environmental quality
  - financial durability
  - funding stability
  - safety and accessibility
  - connectivity
  - whole-life asset management
  - affordability and
  - social and political acceptability

Source: Presentation of Thomas Maier, Managing Director Infrastructure of EBRD, Berlin September 30th 2015
Sustainable infrastructure projects are:

- Set within an integrated and **cross-sector planning** context
- Take into account the perspectives of public, private, and civil society **stakeholders** as well as the value of **ecosystems** and their services
- Planned and designed to deliver accessible and cost effective **infrastructure services** to meet the needs of target populations
- Built to minimize costs of operation and maintenance over the whole **lifecycle of the project**, using proven and well tested technologies
- **Resilient and adaptable** to foreseeable changes including in climate, environment, and demand
- **Economically and fiscally viable** and thus attractive for innovative financing models including private capital

**Source:** IDB draft paper on principles for sustainable infrastructure, May 2015
The MDB’s view on quality of infrastructure (Nov. 2014)

Role of infrastructure:

• Is key to tackling poverty and promoting inclusive growth,
• Helps improve access to basic services, especially for poor people,
• Links producers to markets and connects countries to the opportunities in the global economy,
• Is essential to overcome bottlenecks to growth, and as an enabler of private sector led growth.

Quality of infrastructure spending:

• Infrastructure investments need to be sustainable: fiscally, economically, socially and environmentally.
• Projects need to be carefully selected and designed for effectiveness and efficiency, maximizing their impact on growth and jobs.
• Think about public vs. private sector according to each country’s institutional capacity and policy environment.

Source: Statement by Heads of the MDBs and the IMF on Infrastructure in the context of the Australian G20 summit, Press Release of World Bank, Nov. 13th 2014
The civil society’s view on sustainable infrastructure

Proposed design principles to the Turkish G20-presidency:

• **Comprehensive**
  — Applies a whole systems approach to all facets of the design and development process; aims to simultaneously address multiple goals, requirements, conditions and issues;

• **Anticipatory**
  — Factoring in critical future trends and needs as well as projected impacts of implementation in the short and long term;

• **Ecologically responsible**
  — Reflecting nature's underlying principles while enhancing the Earth’s life support systems;

• **Feasible**
  — Relying on current know-how, tested/acceptable technology and existing resources;

• **Verifiable**
  — Able to withstand rigorous empirical testing;

• **Replicable**
  — Able to scale and adapt to a broad range of conditions.

Source: Open letter to Turkish G20 presidency of March 9th 2015, signed by Foundation Earth and many US signatories
WWF’s view on SI in cities

Sustainable infrastructure includes assets and projects that:

• reduce the **environmental impact** of urban infrastructure such as energy efficiency and renewable energy projects;

• improve the **climate resilience** of urban areas by improving the ability of infrastructure to cope with the consequences of climate change;

• help to **protect biodiversity** and ecosystem services;

• support the **integration of nature-based assets** into urban development.

Source: Financing the Transition: Sustainable Infrastructure in Cities, A Long Finance report prepared by Z/Yen Group and commissioned by WWF; March 2015
Global Infrastructure Basel’s standard on sustainable infrastructure:

Sustainable infrastructure systems are those that:

• Reduce consumption of resources
• Reduce environmental impact
• Increase service value
• Advance social inclusiveness
• Promote transparency and accountability
• Strengthen Human and Labour Rights as well as improve working conditions

Source: SURE Standard Description, Draft for Comment of Sept. 09th, 2015, pages 6f
The Envision Rating System has a very comprehensive approach but does not address the financials.

60 CREDITS IN 5 CATEGORIES

- QUALITY OF LIFE: 13 CREDITS
- LEADERSHIP: 10 CREDITS
- RESOURCE ALLOCATION: 14 CREDITS
- NATURAL WORLD: 15 CREDITS
- CLIMATE AND RISK: 8 CREDITS

5 LEVELS OF ACHIEVEMENT

- IMPROVED
- ENHANCED
- SUPERIOR
- CONSERVING
- RESTORATIVE

Source: Envision Rating System by Harvard University, Zofnass Program for Sustainable Infrastructure
McKinsey addressed the three sustainability dimensions but does not mention governance

**Socially sustainable Infrastructure:**
- Inclusive and respects human rights
- Designed to meet the needs of the poor by increasing access,
- Supports poverty reduction, and
- Reduces vulnerability of people to climate change.

**Environmentally sustainable infrastructure:**
- Mitigates carbon emissions during construction and operation
- Contributes to the transition to a lower carbon economy
- Is resilient in the face of climate-change risks
- Addresses local environmental challenges, especially regarding water provision and air quality.
- Employs different ways of meeting infrastructure service needs, such as demand-side management systems and responsive power grids.

**Economically sustainable Infrastructure:**
- Provides jobs and helps boost GDP
- Does not burden governments with unpayable debt or users with painfully high charges.
- Seeks to build the capabilities of local suppliers and developers.

- Ecosystem integrity
- Efficient natural resource use
- Minimize waste, pollution, and GHG emissions
- Resilience and adaptation to CC and natural disasters

- Information sharing, consultation, participation
- Grievance mechanism
- Worker rights
- Health & Safety
- Access- and benefit-sharing

- Financial & Economic
  - Economically and fiscally viable
  - Technically feasible
  - Cost effective services
  - Provide maintenance throughout lifecycle
  - Transparency, accountability, measurability
  - Local, regional and national level
  - Cross-sectoral synergies

- Environmental

- Social
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Design in an integrated cross-sectoral planning context</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>+</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensure good local, regional, national governance, transparency and accountability</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>++</td>
<td></td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensure resilience, adaptable to natural disasters &amp; climate change</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintain landscapes and ecosystem integrity and functions</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use resources efficiently</td>
<td>++</td>
<td></td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimize waste and hazardous emission including GHG</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Involve affected public, private, and civil society stakeholders</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contract local workers and respect their rights and protect their health and safety</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintain local cultures, heritage, cult. integrity and way of life</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meet the needs of the targeted population</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide cost effective services</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td></td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Be economically and fiscally viable</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td></td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Innovative financial mechanisms including private capital (PPP)</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td></td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintain the assets throughout their lifecycle</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td></td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charge services fees which cover the costs of provision</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td>+</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rely on current know-how, tested technology &amp; existing resources</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
IDB and Mercer identified 30 global initiatives driving investment in sustainable infrastructure:

5 organizations

13 organizations

12 organizations
Initiatives were categorized based on role

**Influencers**
- Those that provide **thought leadership and research** relating to sustainable infrastructure or those working to **influence public or industry policy** and/or the financial system to align infrastructure investment plans with INDCs and other environmental/social outcomes.

**Mobilizers**
- Those seeking to
  i) work with governments to **develop “bankable” projects** and/or
  ii) **convene investors** to channel more funds into sustainable infrastructure projects. In most cases, mobilizers are working with and convening multiple stakeholders.

**Tool Providers**
- Those seeking to **enable integrated environmental or social analysis** of infrastructure projects into the investment and monitoring process, resulting in increased risk-adjusted returns and environmental/social outcomes.
Initiatives were categorized based on role

Influencers
- OECD Centre on Green Finance and Investment
- Energy Transitions Commission
- Global Infrastructure Investor Association (GIIA)
- Long Term Infrastructure Investors Association (LTIIA)
- New Climate Economy / Global Commission on Climate and Economy

GLOBAL FOCUS

Mobilizers
- Aligned Intermediary
- Climate Investor One
- Danish Climate Investment Fund
- Global Climate Partnership Fund
- Global Green Growth Institute
- Global Infrastructure Facility (GIF)
- Global Infrastructure Hub (GI Hub)
- Green Infrastructure Investment Coalition (GIIC)
- Matchmaker
- Public-Private Infrastructure Advisory Facility (PPIAF)
- Sustainable Development Investment Partnership (SDIP)

MOST FOCUS ON EMERGING MARKETS

Tool Providers
- Bloomberg New Energy Finance
- CEEQUAL / BREEM Infrastructure
- ClearingHouse INFRADEV
- EDHEC Infrastructure Institute-Singapore (EDHECinfra)
- Global Infrastructure Basel (GIB)
- GRESB Infrastructure
- Institute for Sustainable Infrastructure (Envision™)
- IRENA Navigator
- Preqin
- SIF – International Infrastructure Support System
- World Bank Renewable Energy Financial Instrument Tool (“REFINe”)

FOCUS VARIES (MOST GLOBAL)
What is sustainable infrastructure?
➤ The landscape of concepts

How we can achieve more sustainability in infrastructure projects?
➤ The interaction of safeguards and SI assessment methods
The Role of IDB’s Safeguard Policies in Promoting Sustainable Infrastructure

Dr. Andreas Georgoulias
Zofnass Program for Sustainable Infrastructure
Harvard University
Scope of Study

Scope

- Investigate the effectiveness of IDB’s Safeguards towards sustainability.

Methods

- Perform a comparative analysis of IDB Safeguards and the Envision Rating System for Sustainable Infrastructure.
- Study application of Safeguards in 9 IDB-funded projects.
- Conduct semi-structured interviews with safeguard specialists involved in these projects.
- Identify key trends, best practices, and lessons to keep improving the Bank’s existing tools and policies for the development of sustainable infrastructure.
## Safeguards and Sustainability

Six IDB cross-sectoral Safeguard policies and guidelines for implementation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Policy</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>OP - 703</td>
<td>Environment and Safeguards Compliance Policy</td>
<td>Prevent and mitigate socio-environmental impacts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OP - 704</td>
<td>Disaster Risk Management Policy</td>
<td>Reduce risks from natural hazards and manage disasters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OP - 710</td>
<td>Operational Policy on Involuntary Resettlement</td>
<td>Improve or restore the living standards of affected populations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OP - 270</td>
<td>Operational Policy on Gender Equality in Development</td>
<td>Promote gender equality and women’s empowerment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OP - 102</td>
<td>Access to Information Policy</td>
<td>Improve transparency and facilitate stakeholder engagement</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Safeguards and Sustainability

**Safeguards**: policies to ensure protection against environmental and social harm, improve development value for stakeholders, and enable countries to meet best international practices.

- Limited understanding of the benefits and environmental and social outcomes that result from Safeguards.

- **Does the application of safeguard policies facilitate the development of sustainable projects?**

  Need to assess the effectiveness of **IDB’s Safeguards** in achieving sustainable outcomes.

  Envision Rating System
  Set of 63 sustainability indicators
The Envision Rating System

63 CREDITS IN 5 CATEGORIES

- QUALITY OF LIFE: 16 CREDITS
- LEADERSHIP: 10 CREDITS
- RESOURCE ALLOCATION: 14 CREDITS
- NATURAL WORLD: 15 CREDITS
- CLIMATE AND RISK: 8 CREDITS

5 LEVELS OF ACHIEVEMENT

- CONVENTIONAL DESIGN
- IMPROVED
- ENHANCED
- SUPERIOR
- CONSERVING
- RESTORATIVE
Comparative Analysis

Alignment between Safeguards and Envision

Dark colors indicate the Envision credits explicitly covered, whereas light colors indicate the Envision credits implicitly covered. White indicates credits that are not covered. The percent coverage was calculated based on the Envision point score of each credit.
Example: Quality of Life

1. PURPOSE

QL1.1 Improve Community Quality of Life
QL1.2 Stimulate Sustainable Growth & Development*
QL1.3 Develop Local Skills and Capabilities*
QL2.1 Enhance Public Health and Safety
QL2.2 Minimize Noise and Vibration
QL2.3 Minimize Light Pollution
QL2.4 Improve Community Mobility and Access
QL2.5 Encourage Alternative Modes of Transportation
QL3.1 Preserve Historic and Cultural resources
QL3.2 Preserve Views and Local Character
QL3.3 Enhance Public Space
QL4.1 Identify and address the needs of women and diverse communities*
QL4.2 Stimulate and promote women’s economic empowerment*
QL4.3 Improve access and mobility of women and diverse communities*

4. VULNERABLE GROUPS

2. WELLBEING

3. COMMUNITY

[Icons for Implicitly Covered, Explicitly Covered - No Indicator, Explicitly Covered with Indicator]
Application of Safeguards in IDB Projects

- C05 - EURUS Wind Farm
- C02 - Juan Sta Maria Airport
- C01 - Quiport Airport
- C04 - Pozo Almonte Solar PV
- C08 - Caracol Industrial Park (PIC)
- C09 - Serra do Mar and Atlantic Forest Mosaics System Socio-Environmental Recovery
- C07 - Mario Covas Rodoanel Road
- C03 - Palmatir Wind Farm
- C06 - Punta del Tigre Combined Cycle Power Generation Project (PTB)
Envision Scores for the 9 Cases

C01_Juan Sta
C02_Palmatir
C03_Pozo Al.
C04_Quipor
C05_EURUS
C06_PTB
C07_Rodoanel
C08_PIC
C09_Serra do Mar

Quality of life | Leadership | Resource Allocation | Natural World | Climate and Risk

0 50 100 150 200 250 300 350 400
The Benefits of Safeguards

IDB Safeguards are instrumental in sustainable performance
- Safeguards doubled the overall Envision performance of projects
- When IDB was involved earlier, sustainability performance was tripled
- Projects would have achieved a zero Envision rating without Safeguards in certain aspects

![Bar chart showing points without safeguards, points added by safeguards, and points influenced by specialists for different projects.](chart.png)
The Benefits of Safeguards

Specialists provide key support to project sponsors
- Help sponsors interpret Safeguard principles, implement initiatives that exceed initial project scope
- 6% - 38% of all points added by Safeguards and all “innovation” credits were influenced by specialists

Safeguards enhance national regulations and capacities
- National regulations are oftentimes not enough to account for specific impacts (e.g. lack of consultation and bird studies in Palmatir/Uruguay, consultation in Pozo Almonte y Calama)
- IDB’s studies set a precedent to guide future regulatory revisions and aid sponsors implement similar innovative projects.
Sustainability Opportunities for Upstream Work

Get involved as early as possible in the project cycle
- Sustainability performance is higher when IDB is involved earlier in the project cycle.
- Address earlier aspects often underestimated by sponsors or not covered by national regulations.

Expand assessments to include a wider spectrum of issues
- Aspects beyond those explicitly mentioned in Safeguards were addressed according to the project context.
- More social and environmental issues would expand the information considered when designing projects.

Further integrate climate change and resource planning
- Climate change and vulnerability analyses should be performed to produce the most resilient designs.
- Adaptation measures can be combined with IDB’s adaptive management practices during design.
Other Recommendations

Adopt a life-cycle approach
- The calculation of impacts during all project phases is critical.
- Strengthen supervision of maintenance and monitoring plans during implementation, extend coverage during operations.

Integrate a performance-based approach with quantifiable targets
- Performance indicators would establish minimum standards to measure and monitor expected outcomes.
- This could also encourage borrowers to go beyond minimum requirements.

Maximize opportunities in Materials, Community, and Resilience
- Focus on the supply chain of materials to further reduce water and energy consumption.
- Operational policies can be expanded to address projects with low social impact.
- Evaluate the cumulative risk exposure from all types of vulnerabilities, including climate change issues.

Evaluate the need for a comprehensive and overarching policy framework
- An umbrella policy on sustainability would establish priorities and performance indicators for sustainable infrastructure, and simplify required documentation and procedures.
Summary: What needs to be done to achieve sustainability of infrastructure projects?

- **DEFINE:** Reach a common understanding of SI criteria encompassing environmental, social and economic sustainability plus governance
- **MEASURE:** Measure the value added of SI and show its benefits
- **INCENTIVIZE:** Create economic incentives for SI – partner with investors (not only impact investing)
- **HELP:** Create expert task forces to help countries with planning and early project preparation:
  - Leverage **economies of scale**
  - Act as **independent advisor** (not tied to a specific financing instrument or institution)
  - Provide sufficient **funding** for this upfront planning processes
  - Achieve a reputation as **trusted but independent partner** of host country governments
Sven-Uwe Mueller
Senior Advisor
on sustainable infrastructure
Seconded by GIZ
to IDB Climate Change and Sustainable Development Sector

Email: sven-uwe.mueller@giz.de
Mobile: +1 (240) 779 3970
Office: +1 (202) 566-4821